

From: Stan Kurtz [president-elect, Generation Rescue]

To: AAP Leadership [sent via email and confirmed as received by phone]

Re: Key Reasons that some people in the community are in an uproar over the AAP Letter About Eli Stone –and suggestions about how to improve AAP / Parent Relations.

Date: 2/19/08

First, let me say that I am not an “it’s all about vaccines” person. If autism were purely a vaccine induced condition all children with autism would be vaccinated and that is not the case. The medical literature points to several environmental toxins and infections, which seem to be involved and I suspect there are other environmental issues, individual immune status, pre-existing infections and toxins and genetic susceptibilities that play a role as well.

Second, my number one personal goal is to help encourage the AAP to treat children with autism and advocate for the development of the safest methods to protect them from disease. Advocacy for treatment is completely separate from making vaccines safer. Most of us who advocate for treatment understand that we are talking about treating autism(s) and there are many ways for children to get autism and many of them do not include the suspicion of vaccines.

Treatment of children with autism has nothing to do with vaccines so please do not let my suggestions about Eli Stone and AAP position on vaccines interfere with our efforts to work together on getting children with autism treated with safe, effective and evidence-based therapies.

My goal in this letter is to review some of the issues that have upset a large number of families and to make suggestions about how the AAP can move forward in better harmony with parents.

My vision is for all of children to be safely protected from disease and for all children with autism to be treated by their pediatrician.

Eli Stone and Vaccine Issues

1.) The US Department of Health and Human Services has conceded that vaccines can contribute to autism.

The US Department of Health and Human Services (HHS, the government agency that oversees the FDA and the CDC) has recently conceded that Thimerosal (50% mercury) containing vaccines administered to a child significantly contributed to the child's regressive autism spectrum disorder in one of the first cases (of

thousands) in federal vaccine court. (10)

This case determination, similar to the story line of Eli Stone, shows that (according to HHS) vaccines have been linked to autism. The community knows about this case and when the AAP spoke out against Eli Stone it looked to some like they were just trying to cover up a fictional television story that was actually based on one family's truth.

2.) AAPs position about mercury in vaccines is not accurate.

In the letter to ABC the AAP wrote: "No mercury is used as a preservative in routinely offered childhood vaccinations."

Mercury is still in 16 vaccines including 5 pediatric vaccines such as 3 flu shots, the HEP-B and the DtaP.

At best, this is similar to saying:

"No caffeine is used in coffee as a preservative."

It is in there, just not as a preservative. Parents are not concerned if mercury is in there as an adjuvant, or as manufacturing residue, or as an inexpensive antibacterial –they just want to know if it is in there. Not stating that mercury is in 5 vaccines used for pediatrics is considered, by many, as deceitful.

What could have been written is something like "Mercury has been removed from many routinely offered childhood vaccines." Or "Childhood mercury exposure from vaccines has been reduced by 65%"

The Truth About Mercury In Vaccines

According to the FDA's website outlining vaccine administration for children (1) there is up to 300 picograms of mercury in the DtaP shot (Tripedia by Sanofi Pasteur, listed as the third item from the FDA website screen shot below)

DTaP	Infanrix (GlaxoSmithKline Biologicals)	Free	Never contained more than a trace of thimerosal, approval date for thimerosal-free formulation 9/29/2000
	Daptacel (Sanofi Pasteur, Ltd)	Free	Never contained Thimerosal
	Tripedia (Sanofi Pasteur, Inc)	Trace(≤0.3 µg Hg/0.5mL dose)	03/07/01

and 25,000 picograms of mercury in one of the pediatric flu shots (Fluzone by Sanofi Pasteur)

Fluzone (Sanofi Pasteur, Inc)	0.01% (12.5 µg/0.25 mL dose, 25 µg/0.5 mL dose) ²
----------------------------------	---

and another pediatric flu shot has 12,500 picograms of mercury (Fluvirin by Novartis Vaccines and Diagnostics Ltd)

Fluvirin (Novartis Vaccines and Diagnostics Ltd)	0.01% (25 µg/0.5 mL dose)
--	---------------------------

and a third pediatric flu shot by the same company under the same name is said to be preservative free but has trace amounts of mercury. The exact amount does not have to be published if they are under 100 picograms but in this case but trace amounts of mercury are higher than trace amounts allowed in orally ingested items but in this case is being injected in a child. How toxic this is may be debatable, but what is not debatable is that there is still some mercury in the vaccine.

Fluvirin (Novartis Vaccines and Diagnostics Ltd) (Preservative Free)	Trace (<1ug Hg/0.5mL dose)
---	----------------------------

Additionally the Hep-B vaccine has up to 500 picograms of mercury (Published in table 2 outside the pediatric section in of the FDA document but labeled for use for "pediatric/adolescent" use). This vaccine is used in pediatrics as well.

Hepatitis B	Engerix-B Pediatric/adolescent	GlaxoSmithKline Biologicals	< 0.0002%	< 0.5 µg/0.5 mL dose
-------------	-----------------------------------	--------------------------------	-----------	----------------------

If I was responsible for public relations and messaging for AAP I would be concerned that saying there is no mercury in vaccines would cause a liability to the AAP if the child gets hurt by the mercury in the vaccine.

A family was recently awarded millions of dollars in one of the first cases in federal vaccine court related to vaccines and autism. That is just one case. (It is not publicly known but there are 12 other cases.) I do not believe the AAP wants this type of liability for inaccuracies or not telling the entire truth about vaccines.

According to the FDA, other mercury containing vaccines (some of them used in children and pregnant or perspective mothers) include the DT vaccine (two of them by Sanofi Pasteur, Inc.), the DtaP vaccine (Tripedia2 Sanofi Pasteur, Inc), two TD vaccines (Mass Public Health and Sanofi Pasteur), the TT (Sanofi

Pasteur), the Hep B (GlaxoSmithKline Biologicals), the Hep A/Hep B, (GlaxoSmithKline Biologicals), the Japanese Encephalitis (Research Foundation for Microbial Diseases of Osaka University), and the Meningococcal (Sanofi Pasteur) (1)

In summary, there are 16 vaccines with mercury including 5 commonly used in pediatrics and all of them commonly used multiple times throughout the lifetime of the individual.

Many of these vaccines are also injected into perspective mothers who, studies show, can pass mercury down to the child through both her umbilical cord and mother's milk.

Pregnant women and breast-feeding women are also marketed the flu shots and that mercury can be considered a pediatric exposure (at least prenatal) since it is passed to the gestating or breast fed child.

Many of the parent groups would like the AAP to advocate for the safe removal of mercury from any vaccine that can cause a pediatric exposure.

Basically, children are still exposed to mercury from vaccines. Mercury has never been safety tested in vaccines and it still is the second worst neurotoxin known to man.

Parents would prefer that AAP statements about vaccines and mercury are truthful. I do not understand why the AAP would deceive the community about mercury in vaccines.

5.) There was never a recall on mercury containing vaccines. Old vaccines are arguably still on the shelves. If a child gets injured from an old mercury containing vaccine after reading your letter to ABC the AAP may be liable.

What I would suggest is a statement like, "Today there are only 5 pediatric vaccines licensed to contain Thimerosal."

6.) The verbiage "no scientific evidence linking vaccines to autism" is not accurate. The statement excludes anecdotes (which are evidence) and ignores unpopular scientific studies. Just because the studies that do link vaccines to autism and/or illness are not popular, it does not mean they do not exist. By saying there is no evidence is something between very biased and deceitful also puts AAP at risk.

An accurate statement might be, "A majority of the published scientific literature does not support a link between vaccines and autism." This is the sentence the CDC used while Jenny was on Oprah. It allows for the fact that some scientific

evidence exists.

If your advisors truly stated there is no scientific evidence, I would consider different advisors. If they are trying to stretch the truth and it just makes the vaccine concerned community angry.

Pediatricians and anecdotal beliefs about vaccines

Some pediatricians might argue there is a history of mercury safety because it has been in vaccines for so long, but that does not prove its safe through scientific study. That might be considered scientific evidence (anecdotes) but not scientific study.

I find it interesting that the AAP may say that vaccines are safe based on anecdotes while at the same time criticizing parents for anecdotal evidence about diets and vitamins helping (and at times recovering) children with autism. With the new evidence about how diets help ADHD, it seems that the more AAP criticizes parent anecdotes the more they may have to apologize as the science continues to support parent observations.

Besides the older human studies that link vaccines to autism that may be unpopular my some at the AAP, there are more recent scientific studies that link vaccines and mercury to brain damage in primates (3 – Burbacker Ph.D., University of Washington) mice (4 – Horning Ph.D., Columbia University), and it would be hard not to at least say vaccines may have played a role in the recent human autopsy study where Harvard scientists found oxidative damage and a 68.2% increase in mercury in the brains of children with autism compared to controls (5). Additionally there is the recent publication that showed there is more mercury in the blood of children diagnosed with autism compared to controls (11).

The sooner toxins are removed from vaccines, the sooner people will look else where. If I were a strategist at the AAP, I would be advocating for mercury and other toxins to be removed from vaccines while publicly pointing to how harmful mercury and other toxins in the environment are. I would not choose to stand in front of the bullet of possible problems with vaccines, I would work to deflect it.

In reality, no formal studies have been conducted by anyone to see if vaccines cause autism, so I would think the AAP would shy away from saying vaccines do not cause harm and leave that to the CDC or the FDA.

Does the AAP want the liability of inaccurate statements like the ones made in the ABC letter?

Realistically, as the truth about the good and the bad about vaccines comes out and how the public was only told the good things --people will be upset at the folks

who did not tell the balanced truth. Let that be the CDC and the FDA. If it is the AAP it will add to the breakdown of trust between parents and pediatricians. I would consider staying on the side of the children by advocating for safer vaccines and stating the balanced and accurate truth.

How about saying, “Vaccine technology is not perfect, but vaccines save lives and we are continually working with the pharmaceutical companies and the CDC to make them as safe as they can be for all children.”

I suspect the AAP holds back the whole truth about vaccines in order to keep people vaccinating. There needs to be a way for people to vaccinate and also put pressure on vaccine makers to make safer vaccines. By not actively advocating for safer vaccines and independent safety studies the AAP is enabling the problem by covering up parent reports that should be pushed to the vaccine makers.

This position may needlessly put some children at risk of vaccine injury.

By only telling the good side about vaccines, and then saying they don't have mercury, and there is no scientific evidence they cause autism, you are also taking on liability of vaccine injury or autism that may be, at times and in certain kids, triggered by mercury and/or other potentially toxic ingredients in vaccines.

The Department of Health and Human Services already conceded one of the first 4800 vaccine cases here in the US. The MMR case in the UK is still ongoing.

I believe the AAP should be quietly talking to vaccine makers to get them to make vaccines safer (work to replace toxic ingredients like mercury, aluminum, antifreeze and formaldehyde) and start talking to the CDC and FDA about vaccine safety studies.

7.) Today's vaccines are not perfect

Vaccines have been scientifically linked to cause chronic illness. A recent study published this month in the Journal of Allergy and Clinical Immunology said that out of 11,531 children studied, the ones who simply delayed the DtaP vaccines had half the risk of getting asthma compared to the ones who followed the routine schedule. (7) More vaccine studies like this are soon to be published in the next few months.

It might be a good time to push the responsibility for vaccine safety on the CDC and FDA and be on the side of “let's keep vaccinating (at least for critical diseases) while working with pharmaceutical companies to make vaccines as safe as possible for all children.”

8.) Vaccine mercury is not the “safer mercury,” for humans

Studies show that ethylmercury can be methylated into methylmercury in the human body. The data goes back to 1974 where organic mercury was shown to be methylated into methyl mercury by e-coli, strep, staph, and yeasts commonly found in stool (8) and often found in greater rates in children with autism.

Rather than just supporting genetic studies, which have not been directly causal, it may make sense to support studies that look at GI flora or immune status studies to help determine who may be susceptible to vaccine injury and who might benefit from treatment prior to vaccination. Tests like these are readily available.

Many parents also work to on ways to lower a child's vaccine toxicity risk by improving good bacteria and lessening the bad bacteria that can methylate mercury and interfere with immune regulation and detoxification.

Additionally, studies show raised levels of ethyl and methyl mercury in the saliva of people with amalgam fillings, another link to how amounts of one type of mercury in the human body (possibly through bacterial methylation) can raise levels of both types of mercury (9). I raise this point in case to address the folks that say vaccine mercury is "a safer" mercury. Evidence suggests that in the human body there may be no such thing as a safe type of mercury.

9.) Studies on the effectiveness of the flu shot are mixed

Regarding the flu shot, which was the basis of the Eli Stone episode, there are several scientific studies that show that the flu shot is not effective for fighting the flu. Many parents are thinking, why would the AAP push the risk of a mercury when the studies on flu shot effectiveness are mixed?

10.) There are no safety studies published about vaccines

If I were taking responsibility for the safety of vaccines and there was mounting evidence of concern about chronic illness and autism and there were no safety studies, I would be concerned. I would not want the risk of possible harm to fall on the AAP. I would be advocating for all agencies and the pharmaceutical companies to be working to make sure vaccines are the safest they can be.

11.) Most parents are not "anti-vaccine," they are "pro safe-vaccines for all children."

The community hates when parents say, "It appears that a vaccine may have injured my child" and the response back is "mercury does not cause autism."

Parents are not just concerned about mercury, they are concerned about the safety of vaccines for their individual child. Its not that they are "anti-vaccine." Just about every parent wants safe protection for their children from disease and

vaccines are not safe for all children.

The community wants the AAP to advocate for the safest vaccines possible for all children. Saying parents are “anti-vaccine” is not accurate, and continues to be inflammatory. Stating parents are anti-vaccine and mercury does not cause autism just upsets the community and demonstrates that the AAP is not listening or understanding parent concerns.

12.) Jenny McCarthy is not anti-vaccine, she is “Pro Treatment of Children With Autism” and “Pro safe-Vaccines for All Children.”

By calling Jenny McCarthy anti-vaccine, you are infuriating her. By writing a press release asking for parents and celebrities to take the perceived opposite side of Jenny while calling her anti-vaccine the AAP is basically just asking for a battle against Jenny and the millions of parents who support her.

From the very beginning, Jenny has been supportive of communication with the AAP and she has staying personally involved in efforts to help get the children treated.

Jenny does believe that vaccines injured her child and there is evidence of that, but she has NOT been blaming the AAP. She has been focused on the CDC. Jenny’s main focus on the AAP to date has been to work to treat children.

As Jenny’s close advisor I can tell you that she was the one who called the AAP and asked to work with you. She could have gone on the air this week and talked badly about the AAP, and she chose not to. She could have talked badly about the AAP on all the talk shows on the last media tour. Instead, she reached out to the AAP to try to connect with you and to work to get children with autism treated and to make vaccines safer.

There have been no measurable results from her efforts so far and with the recent press release labeling Jenny as anti-vaccine and asking for help to fight against her has threw her into a rage about the AAP. It seems she is another parent who feels she is not being heard.

13.) Parents are not just concerned about mercury.

There are many scientifically confirmed toxins and other concerning ingredients in vaccines including aluminum, antifreeze and formaldehyde and others and after 60 years no one has safety tested them.

If you look at aluminum in the medical literature you’ll fine at least 40 very concerning studies some specifically about vaccine aluminum.

Additionally there are no studies that look at the combination of these ingredients and the safety of children.

When thinking about the safety of vaccines it is important to realize that viruses lower glutathione, the bodies best antioxidant. The body uses glutathione to protect against mercury and aluminum and help remove these toxins before they bind to tissue.

When there is a study conducted on mercury or other toxins in vaccines you should also study the affects of the multiple toxins injected during the presence of a virus (or other infection). This is especially important considering many injections of mercury and/or aluminum containing vaccines occur in conjunction with viral containing or immune stimulating vaccines.

There are several animal studies that show that heavy metals move to the brain in the presence of a viral infection (12, 13). There are also studies that show that children with autism do not build immunity to certain viruses like typical children. It may be possible that if the child with an abnormal immune status is injected with a live virus and heavy metals at the same time it may set them up for injury compared to typical children.

It is common knowledge not to vaccinate the children when they are sick, but the vaccination process often activates the immune system. That process combined with multiple neurotoxins like mercury and aluminum (and possibly the presence of intra-body bacteria that can make metals more toxic) may be worse than just the presence of mercury and aluminum alone.

Summary About Vaccines and Mercury

In summary parents want safe vaccines - greener vaccines and a more realistic vaccination schedule. There are probably some infections that we don't have to risk this toxic exposure for.

The community wants the AAP to stand up for safer vaccines for all children and wants the AAP to be honest about mercury and other toxins and that vaccines do harm at least some children (according to CDC VAERS data, parent reports, and the recent HHS concession in vaccine court).

The message to the public should not be about vaccinating vs. not vaccinating while not disclosing all the facts about vaccines. The community wants an open dialog about making vaccines safer for all children --today. This requires communication between parents and the AAP (and possibly the CDC, FDA and vaccine makers) and for the AAP to stand up for the rights of all children being vaccinated by working to make vaccines safe for all children.

Parents continue to say “Please make vaccines safer and get the toxins out of vaccines.” You should stop upsetting parents by painting them as “anti-vaccine,” while at the same time wondering why more and more parents are not trusting their pediatrician.

The fear of an epidemic caused by people having some kind of mass panic after hearing a more rounded truth about vaccines seems to cause AAP to avoid any open discussion about making vaccines safer for all children... but evidence of vaccine side effects (injury) are mounting and so is community awareness.

I believe it's time for the AAP to truly advocate for all children. It's time for the AAP to get the parents back by helping to make vaccines safer and to work to treat children with autism.

Once open discussions start and progress is made I am confident that the community will be happy to also include discussions of environmental mercury and aluminum (and other toxins), pesticides and viral and bacterial infections, mothers mercury burden from environmental toxins prior to giving birth – all of which are linked or associated to autism or possible child injury in the medical literature.

Many factors play a role in child health and the onset of autism and the more we are able to look at each one and layout a macro framework of toxins and triggers, the less pressure will rest on just vaccines and/or the AAP. Parents know it's not just the vaccines that are causing toxicity in children, its just one factor that the community feels needs to be addressed as they move forward. The more the AAP and other organizations stand in the way of the accurate truth being public and improvements being made the more the community with distrust their pediatrician and stand up against the AAP.

As parents become more aware of the facts, AAPs future really rests on a parent/AAP partnership demonstrating measurable efforts towards the care for all children --not just the fortunate ones who can handle today's vaccines (and growing environmental factors) without injury.

14.) Most importantly, the AAP should be treating all children, including ones with autism.

I would strongly suggest a strategy that puts the AAP on the side of vaccine safety AND on the side of treating children with autism.

Open communication is the key and I believe it starts with a plan to:

- 1.) Teach pediatricians how to treat children with autism.

- 2.) Advocate for safer vaccines and a safer vaccine schedule.
- 3.) Stop fighting with parents and start listening to them and partnering with them.

My Suggestions:

- 1.) The AAP should draft a public apology for the inaccuracies about mercury in vaccines and the statement that no scientific evidence exists between vaccines and autism. I can help you with this. I think the AAP would immediately benefit by making this announcement at the rally and/or the AAP Conference.
- 2.) Approve the “Treating Comorbid Conditions in Autism” workshop for the AAP conference. This workshop does not involve vaccines in any way. There is no downside in approving this workshop that helps physicians learn how to help children with autism. I think this would weigh heavily in the parent community and you need a win with them right now. If you can, you may want to make this announcement at the rally and/or the AAP Conference.
- 3.) We need to put more safe and effective treatments into the Autism Toolkit ASAP. The meeting that you suggested this month seems like a start.
- 4.) The AAP should shy away from being the mouthpiece for vaccine safety and, if anything, carefully speak out to the pharmaceutical companies about making vaccines safe for the greatest number of children.
- 5.) The AAP should immediately stop looking at Jenny McCarthy as someone on the other side and respond to her requests to make vaccines safer and to treat children with autism. She represents moms who want safer vaccines and a better vaccine schedule and she wants children with autism to be treated. She is not anti-vaccine. Ignoring her intention and antagonizing her will only lead to her responding against the AAP.
- 6.) The AAP should stop calling parents anti-vaccine. They are parents who want safer vaccines for all children. I believe we all want that. The AAP should apologize to parents for lumping them into an anti-vaccine title.

In summary, I wanted to share with you some background on why parents are concerned about AAPs position about vaccines, mercury and autism and to guide you as to how to resolve those issues. I still have faith that the AAP cares about the safety and health of all children and I visualize the AAP doing the right thing for all at this critical time for our society.

If the AAP appropriately responds, I am committed to make sure that the community appropriately supports the AAP.

As I stated earlier, I am not an “it’s all about vaccines” person. I follow the medical literature and there are many environmental issues linked to autism. My primary focus and passion is to get children the treatment they deserve the same way my son did. Irregardless of how this particular communication is received, I would like to get back to our discussion about how to bring the community closer to the AAP through safe, effective and evidence-based treatments and I look forward to our continued discussions and I look forward to meeting with you soon.

My best,

Stan Kurtz

Citations:

- 1.) <http://www.fda.gov/cber/vaccine/thimerosal.htm>
- 2.) J Allergy Clin Immunol. 2008 Jan 17 Delay in diphtheria, pertussis, tetanus vaccination is associated with a reduced risk of childhood asthma. McDonald KL, Huq SI, Lix LM, Becker AB, Kozyrskyj AL. Faculty of Medicine, Department of Community Health Sciences, University of Manitoba, Winnipeg, Manitoba, Canada. PMID 18207561
- 3.) Comparison of Blood and Brain Mercury Levels in Infant Monkeys Exposed to Methylmercury or Vaccines Containing Thimerosal. Thomas Burbacher, PhD
- 4.) Neurotoxic Effects of Postnatal Thimerosal are Mouse Strain Dependent Molecular Psychiatry, Sep 2004. Mady Hornig, MD
- 5.) Oxidative Stress in Autism: Elevated Cerebellar 3-nitrotyrosine level www.scipub.org/fulltext/ajbb/ajbb4273-84.pdf
- 6.) <http://www.uscfc.uscourts.gov/OSM/Autism/modifying.pdf>
- 7.) [J Allergy Clin Immunol](#). 2008 Jan 17 Delay in diphtheria, pertussis, tetanus vaccination is associated with a reduced risk of childhood asthma. McDonald KL, Huq SI, Lix LM, Becker AB, Kozyrskyj AL. PMID: 18207561
- 8.) [Experientia](#). 1975 Sep 15;31(9):1064-5. The methylation of mercuric chloride by human intestinal bacteria. Rowland IR, Grasso P, Davies MJ. PMID: 1100426
- 9.) [Caries Res](#). 2001 May-Jun;35(3):163-6. Dental amalgam fillings and the amount of organic mercury in human saliva. Leistevuo J, Leistevuo T, Helenius H, Pyy L, Osterblad M, Huovinen P, Tenovuo J. PMID: 11385194

- 10.) <http://www.uscfc.uscourts.gov/OSM/Autism/modifying.pdf>
- 11.) [J Child Neurol](#). 2007 Nov;22(11):1308-11. **Blood levels of mercury are related to diagnosis of autism: a reanalysis of an important data set.** [Desoto MC](#), [Hitlan RT](#). Department of Psychology, University of Northern Iowa, Cedar Falls, Iowa 50614, USA. cathy.desoto@uni.edu PMID: 18006963
- 12.) [Environ Res](#). 2006 Nov;102(3):308-13. Epub 2006 Apr 17 **Iron and copper accumulation in the brain of coxsackievirus-infected mice exposed to cadmium.** [Ilback NG](#), [Lindh U](#), [Minqin R](#), [Friman G](#), [Watt F](#). Section of Infectious Diseases, Department of Medical Sciences, Uppsala University Hospital, S-751 85 Uppsala, Sweden. nils-gunnar.ilback@slv.se PMID: 16616136
- 13.) [Environ Res](#). 2007 Sep 20; **Tissue uptake of mercury is changed during the course of a common viral infection in mice.**[Frisk P](#), [Molin Y](#), [Ilbäck NG](#). "...An infection-induced increase of Hg in the brain..." PMID: 17888900